Communication to the Planning Commission



Planning and Zoning Division Department of Community Development

TO:

Salt Lake City Planning Commission

FROM:

Joel Paterson, Planning Program Manager

Doug Dansie, Senior Planner

DATE:

December 5, 2007

RE:

Issues Only Hearing re: City Creek Center

Petitions 410-06-38 and 410-07-44

OVERVIEW

On December 12, 2007, the Planning Commission will hold an Issues Only public hearing as part of its ongoing review of the City Creek Center development project. The Planning Commission will receive a presentation from the applicants, City Creek Reserve, Inc. (CCRI) and Taubman Centers, Inc., on two petitions:

- Petition 410-06-38 A request for planned development approval for overall site plan and design approval, including a request for approval of a proposed skybridge over Main Street at approximately 50 South Main Street. The applicants will highlight the changes that have been made to the project since the last review by the Planning Commission. This presentation will also provide greater detail on the site plans, building elevations, landscape and streetscape improvements and new information on the preliminary design concepts for the proposed skybridge.
- **Petition 410-07-44** A request for Conditional Use approval for property located at approximately 50 East 100 South, to:
 - 1. Allow construction of a building that would be approximately two hundred sixty-five feet (265') tall, which would exceed the D-1 Central Business District maximum building height regulation of one hundred feet (100') for a mid-block building. This request is in addition to the previous Planning Commission approvals to allow additional building height at other mid-block locations within the City Creek Center development.

2. Allow a portion of the building façade to be setback approximately fifteen feet (15') from the front property line, which would exceed the D-1 Central Business District maximum front yard setback regulation of five feet (5').

The purpose of this Issues Only public hearing is to allow the applicants to present more detailed site plans, elevations and an initial design for the proposed skybridge. Furthermore, the Planning Commission will take public comment and provide direction to the applicants regarding the current proposals.

BACKGROUND

Beginning in October 2006, the applicants have submitted several petitions relevant to the overall development of City Creek Center, including requests to

- Amend the Downtown Master Plan and the Urban Design Plan.

 Status: The City Council amended the Planning Commission recommendation and adopted *Ordinance 13 of 2007*. Attachment A includes the language adopted by the City Council that details the extenuating circumstances and minimum requirements that must be met in order for the City Council to approve an exception to allow a skybridge. Attachment B includes the notes from the May 23, 2007 Planning Commission meeting where the Planning Commission detailed the information the Planned Development submittal should contain in order to appropriately determine whether or not the skybridge design complies with the standards adopted by the City Council. The applicants' response may be found in the attached three-ring binder under the tab titled "Sky Bridge Proposal," pages 1-9.
- Approve partial street closures.
 <u>Status</u>: The City Council has held a briefing and a public hearing on the proposed partial street closures but has not yet taken final action. CCRI has withdrawn the request for the proposed partial street closure to extend the Social Hall pedestrian tunnel. In the future, the Planning Commission will be asked to make a recommendation on the proposed partial street closure on Main Street to allow the sale of air-rights for the proposed skybridge.
- Grant planned development approval for the overall site and development plans. <u>Status</u>: The Planning Commission review is on-going.
- Grant conditional use approval for additional building height at mid-block locations and to allow modification of maximum building setbacks.
 Status: The Planning Commission has granted conditional use approval to allow several buildings to exceed the maximum building height requirements at certain mid-block locations and to modify the maximum setback requirement on certain buildings. The applicant has submitted an additional petition, 410-07-44, requesting additional building height and setback for a building on 100 South. This petition will be considered during this Issues Only public hearing and a decision will be made at a future Planning Commission meeting.

PUBLIC INPUT

The Planning Division hosted a public open house on November 29, 2007 to allow the applicants to make a presentation on the changes that have been made to the project, introduce details regarding the conceptual design of the proposed skybridge and the new conditional use petition. Although only eight people signed the attendance role, approximately twenty to thirty people attended the open house. At this time, no written comments have been submitted from the open house. The following list is a summary of the public comments that were made at the open house.

- Confusion regarding UTA's request that the skybridge be enclosed when this was not required for the pedestrian bridge over East Campus Drive and the University TRAX line at the University of Utah was allowed to be open.
- Nordstrom façade on West Temple needs more openings potentially small retail spaces incorporated into the façade.
- Realignment of Regents Street is a positive improvement.
- The project appears to be transparent (lots of glass at street-level) but would benefit from additional doors/entryways for pedestrians.
- Some retailers to the south of City Creek Center are opposed to the skybridge because it will not encourage pedestrians to walk north and south of the project.
- Emphasis seems to be on east-west alignment of retail along the galleria.
- Amount of retail space is a positive element.
- Eliminate the skybridge and use a grand staircase to encourage pedestrians on the second level to descend to Main Street.
- Skybridges seem more successful in much larger urban centers and not as successful in smaller urban centers such as Salt Lake City.
- Use of escalators and the skybridge is exciting and will be successful. Gateway was used as an example.
- Generally positive comments regarding the design of the facades and street-level.
- Will the project include space for small (local) retailers along the street frontages?
- Need to ensure that the housing actually contributes to 24-hour activity. Concern that new residents will be older and lack diversity.
- Keep galleria and other pedestrian access through the project open 24-hours.
- The proposed reduction in height of Tower 4 on South Temple isolates the building between two much taller buildings.
- Will "branding" or signage be allowed on the skybridge?
- Concern that an enclosed skybridge and galleria will discourage pedestrian activity on the adjacent public streets.

ISSUES TO CONSIDER:

The Planning Staff has requested that the applicants provide additional detail as indicated in the following list.

- Additional architectural details on new building elevations, particularly on 100 South.
- Additional architectural details on 2nd level retail.
- Additional architectural details on building entrances/modules, leasable areas.
- Additional information about tenants and land uses.

- Additional information about building entrances on Main Street specifically Macy's.
- Narrative specifying building materials.
- Narrative and/or graphics addressing the view corridor issues with the skybridge.
- Additional elevations and details on skybridge design, including views north and south, oblique views of bridge connection to street walls, and pedestrian views entering and leaving the east and west ends of the bridge.
- Discussion on skybridge as an open platform and focal point vs. a glass enclosure.
- Discussion of grand staircases in the Galleria on both sides of Main Street.
- Potential for additional multi-story uses that will penetrate the 2nd level.
- Additional graphics/information on evaluation of 'other reasonable alternatives' to the bridge.
- Additional elevations depicting vitality of Main Street ground level and foot traffic.

Attachments:

- A. Ordinance 13 of 2007 Amending the Downtown Master Plan and the Urban Design Element
- B. Planning Commission notes regarding Master Plan Amendments Standards for Skybridge Review (May 23, 2007)
- C. Three-ring Binder: Support material for Petitions 410-06-38 and 410-07-44

Attachment A
Ordinance 13 of 2007
Amending the Downtown Master Plan
and the Urban Design Element

SALT LAKE CITY ORDINANCE

No. 13 of 2007

(Amending the Salt Lake Downtown Master Plan and the Urban Design Element

AN ORDINANCE AMENDING THE SALT LAKE CITY DOWNTOWN MASTER PLAN AND THE URBAN DESIGN ELEMENT PURSUANT TO PETITION NO. 400-06-37

WHEREAS, Utah Code Annotated Section 10-9a-404 outlines the process for adopting or amending the City general plan; and

WHEREAS, after public hearings before the Planning Commission and the City Council, the City Council has determined that the following amendments to the Salt Lake City Downtown Master Plan and the Urban Design Element are in the best interests of the City;

NOW, THEREFORE, be it ordained by the City Council of Salt Lake City, Utah:

SECTION 1. The Salt Lake City Downtown Master Plan, as previously adopted by the City, includes a section discussing "View Corridors". That section, currently located on page 30 of the Plan, shall be and hereby is amended to read as follows:

View Corridors: Views from downtown to the mountains and major landmarks should also be preserved. Skywalk or other obstructions that would block view corridors are prohibited on Main Street, State Street, West Temple. South Temple, 100 South, 200 South, 300 South and 400 South, and are discouraged on other streets.

The City Council, after recommendation by the Planning Commission, may authorize exceptions to the policy o prohibiting skywalks on Main Street, State Street, West Temple, South Temple, 100 South, 200 South, 300 South and 400 South, and allow for up to one skywalk per view corridor if they find justification based upon the following extenuating circumstances and minimum requirements:

- A. A unified development proposal which includes no less than 7.5 acres of retail/residential mixed use located on each of the two blocks on opposite sides of one of the streets listed above is submitted by the property owner / developer to the Planning Commission, and the unified development contains no other skywalk
- B. All other reasonable alternatives for creating a successful at-grade link between opposite sides of the stree have been evaluated and found not to be feasible due to:
 - 1. A safety concern or
 - 2. physical barrier or
 - 3. insufficient integration of both sides of the development via an at-grade link
- C. A finding is made that a compelling public interest exists through substantial demonstration of each of the following:
 - 1. The proposed development would contribute to the objective of creating an active, vibran streetscape by connecting people easily from upper levels to the street level corridor and maximizing public movement through architectural elements such as elevaors, escalators, or grand

entrances.

- 2. The skywalk would be designed such that impacts on an identified view corridor would be minimal.
- 3. The proposed development utilizes urban design, architectural elements and visual connections including pedestrian linkages that actively enhance the project's relationship to surrounding blocks and economic development opportunities for those blocks.
- D. Application of street level urban design elements for an entire project that enhance a primary pedestriar focus, requiring components including but not limited to all of the following
 - 1. Maximize permeable block faces through actions including but not limited to
 - a) Landscaped project entrances on each block face that open the block with pedestriar corridors, and;
 - b) Maximize visual permeability into a store or by a legitimate display window, and
 - c) Maximize outward facing retail on all block faces.
 - 2. Enhanced pedestrian amenities on all block faces such as but not limited to shading devices signage and seating.
 - 3. Uses on all external block faces that support pedestrian activity including but not limited to restaurants, residential, or retail uses comparable to internal commercial activity

After recommendation from the Planning Commission, the City Council (as the land use authority) shall have fine approval of a skywalk as part of the street vacation process authorized by State Code. The Council may choose, or an individual project basis, to add specific project and skywalk related design or other urban planning policy elements, criteria or conditions as part of the related street vacation action.

SECTION 2. The Salt Lake City Urban Design Element, as previously adopted by the City, include section identifying view corridors and discussing skybridges. Those sections, currently located on pages 20, 21, 21 and 87, shall be and hereby are amended to read as follows:

Page 20: Salt Lake City has many view corridors which influence both the urban form of the City and th development character of its districts and communities. The most prominent include the following (see Vista Protection Map). (Figure 8.)

- --State Street corridor of the State Capitol Building and surrounding foothills
- --Exchange Place terminating at the Post Office Building
- -- Main Street to the Daughters of the Utah Pioneers Museum
- --200 South East to the University of Utah Park Building.
- --300 South terminating at the D&RGW Railroad Depot.
- --South Temple from Union Pacific Depot to Federal Heights foothills
- --First Avenue terminating at the LDS Temple Square
- --West Temple Street.
- -- 100 South Street.
- --400 South Street.
- --Ensign Peak.
- --Oquirrh Vista.
- -- Wasatch Foothills.

Page 21: The map entitled "Gateways and Vistas" shall be amended to designate West Temple Street, 100 South Street and 400 South Street as street view corridors.

- Page 23: The use of skybridges should be carefully planned. Skybridges on streets identified as "majo: view corridors" should be prohibited, except as otherwise authorized in the Salt Lake City Downtown Master Plan
- Page 87: Emphasize street level open space first, inner block pedestrian networks second, and below and above grade networks third. Skyways should not take activity away from the street or detract from principal views except as otherwise authorized in the Salt Lake City Downtown Master Plan.
- SECTION 3: Copies of the revised Downtown Master Plan and the Urban Design Element shall be maintained in the office of the Salt Lake City Planning Division
 - SECTION 4. This Ordinance shall become effective on the date of its first publication.

Passed by the City Council of Salt Lake City, Utah this 17th day of April, 2007.

Attachment B
Planning Commission notes regarding
Master Plan Amendments – Standards for
Skybridge Review (May 23, 2007)

Downtown Master Plan Amendment

Planning Division notes (in blue) at Planning Commission (May 23, 2007) concerning standards for sky bridge review

The City Council, after recommendation by the Planning Commission, may authorize exceptions to the policy of prohibiting skywalks on Main Street, State Street, West Temple, South Temple, 100 South, 200 South, 300 South and 400 South, and allow for up to one skywalk per view corridor if they find justification based upon the following extenuating circumstances and minimum requirements:

The Commission would like to see the Planned Development submittal for City Creek at the same time as the review of the sky bridge. The submittal should have sufficient detail in order to appropriately determine whether or not the bridge design complies with the required standards.

- A. A unified development proposal which includes no less than 7.5 acres of retail/residential mixed use located on each of the two blocks on opposite sides of one of the streets listed above is submitted by the property owner / developer to the Planning Commission, and the unified development contains no other skywalk.
- B. All other reasonable alternatives for creating a successful at-grade link between opposite sides of the street have been evaluated and found not to be feasible due to:
 - 1. A safety concern or
 - 2. physical barrier or
 - 3. insufficient integration of both sides of the development via an at-grade link

'other reasonable alternatives' should be shown graphically (plan views and/or elevations) so that other alternatives can be assessed. Verbal descriptions of alternatives will not be acceptable.

- C. A finding is made that a compelling public interest exists through substantial demonstration of each of the following:
 - 1. The proposed development would contribute to the objective of creating an active, vibrant streetscape by connecting people easily from upper levels to the street level corridor and maximizing public movement through architectural elements such as elevators, escalators, or grand entrances.

The design needs to show specifically how people on the 2nd level access the street level.

The skywalk would be designed such that impacts on an identified view corridor would be minimal.

A full bridge design needs to be submitted for review.

3. The proposed development utilizes urban design, architectural elements and visual connections including pedestrian linkages that actively enhance the project's relationship to surrounding blocks and economic development opportunities for those blocks.

There should be no back side of the project. Elevations, particularly building entrances need to be shown.

- D. Application of street level urban design elements for an entire project that enhance a primary pedestrian focus, requiring components including but not limited to all of the following:
 - 1. Maximize permeable block faces through actions including but not limited to:
 - a) Landscaped project entrances on each block face that open the block with pedestrian corridors, and;
 - b) Maximize visual permeability into a store or by a legitimate display window, and
 - c) Maximize outward facing retail on all block faces.

Building elevations should be shown of each block face.

- 2. Enhanced pedestrian amenities on all block faces such as but not limited to shading devices, signage and seating.
- 3. Uses on all external block faces that support pedestrian activity including but not limited to restaurants, residential, or retail uses comparable to internal commercial activity.

General information about the type of tenants on each street frontage and throughout the project would be helpful. There needs to be an indication as to where the restaurants, residential, and retail would be located in the project.

After recommendation from the Planning Commission, the City Council (as the land use authority) shall have final approval of a skywalk as part of the street vacation process authorized by State Code. The Council may choose, on an individual project basis, to add specific project and skywalk related design or other urban planning policy elements, criteria or conditions as part of the related street vacation action.

There is a significant grade change from east to west with an approximate drop of eight feet on West Temple. This grade change needs to be taken into consideration in the planned development application, specifically addressing the relationship to building facades and streets.

Attachment C Three-ring Binder: Support material for Petitions 410-06-38 and 410-07-44